



Western Conceptions of the Individual

Review Author[s]:
Alan MacFarlane

American Anthropologist, New Series, Volume 95, Issue 2 (Jun., 1993), 471-472.

Stable URL:

<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0002-7294%28199306%292%3A95%3A2%3C471%3AWCOTI%3E2.0.CO%3B2-Y>

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/about/terms.html>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

American Anthropologist is published by American Anthropological Association. Please contact the publisher for further permissions regarding the use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/journals/anthro.html>.

American Anthropologist
©1993 American Anthropological Association

JSTOR and the JSTOR logo are trademarks of JSTOR, and are Registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office. For more information on JSTOR contact jstor-info@umich.edu.

©2003 JSTOR

likely to be the main audience, and anthropologists specifically concerned with orality will no doubt also find their way to the book, it should have a wider readership among those of us more generally interested in the temporal organization of culture.

War in the Tribal Zone: Expanding States and Indigenous Warfare. R. Brian Ferguson and Neil L. Whitehead, eds. School of American Research Advanced Seminar Series. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 1992. 324 pp.

BRUCE LINCOLN
University of Minnesota

While summarizing a 1986 seminar entitled "The Anthropology of War" and commenting on the broader literature, Brian Ferguson deplored a general failure to consider the effects of Western contact on indigenous patterns of warfare (*The Anthropology of War*, Cambridge University Press, 1990, p. 51). *War in the Tribal Zone* results from a seminar that was held three years later to make good on that failure. Its ten essays focus on the ways in which contact between relatively powerful states or empires (usually, but not always European) and the peoples they encounter in the course of expansion modifies the likelihood and nature of violent conflict.

Wars of conquest and subsequent struggles between colonizer and colonized provide the most obvious case, but these figure in only a few chapters (D. J. Mattingly on Roman North Africa, R. A. L. H. Gunawardana on early Sri Lanka, R. Hassig's "Aztec and Spanish Conquest in Mesoamerica"). Others center on what the editors call "the tribal zone": the ambiguous territory from the point of contact into the hinterlands, where even groups with no direct experience of the intruders feel their effects through the mediations of others. This is a space of negotiation and maneuver, where events have serious consequences for those on both sides; for just as the intruders' processes of state formation are affected by their experience here, so also the corporate identity and institutions of indigenes are regularly reconstituted, with the emergence of new "tribes" or proto-states as the result (R. Law on the West African Slave Coast, N. Whitehead on northeastern South America).

Although most of the papers are written by anthropologists, only Andrew Strathern's study of conflicts in the Papua New Guinea Highlands since 1986 is based primarily on

fieldwork. The rest are historical assessments of the decades, or even centuries, that followed "first contact." Some authors tell their stories from the perspective of the intruding powers, consistent with the nature of the written records, and pay particular attention to the ways in which these actors employed strategies of territorial and/or hegemonic control. Others take the opposite tack, reading the records against their grain and emphasizing the historical agency of indigenes, who shifted between stances of accommodation, resistance, and withdrawal (M. Brown and E. Fernandez on the Ashaninka of eastern Peru).

Along these lines and others, two papers are particularly valuable: Thomas Abler's "Iroquois Military Fortunes in the Face of European Colonization" and Brian Ferguson's "Western Contact and the Yanomami War Complex." Both argue that preexisting patterns of hostility were transformed by complex and interrelated changes in demography and mortality rates, residence and kinship patterns, weaponry, and trade opportunities that followed contact. In particular, they show how the entry of powerful outsiders produced a dramatic increase in the supply of certain goods (firearms, steel tools), for which demand rapidly rose, while also producing an equally dramatic increase in the demand for indigenous products (e.g., furs and rubber, and elsewhere, slaves). As groups sought to control the most desired goods and the trade routes through which these circulated, while also coping with the decimations wrought by newly introduced diseases, they became involved in diplomatic relations and martial conflicts on a larger and more destructive scale than ever before. Hardly the product of a culturally (but ahistorically) conditioned "fierceness," still less of some Hobbesian state of nature, warfare in these instances is seen to result from strategic choices made by resourceful actors as they struggled, most often unsuccessfully, to make the best of a very specific—and very disruptive—historic trajectory.

The papers in this volume are of uniformly high quality and form a coherent set. Collectively, they make an important point, contribute to the merging of anthropological and historic modes of inquiry, and open up novel perspectives on a classic topic.

Western Conceptions of the Individual. Brian Morris. New York: Berg (distr. by St. Martin's Press), 1991. 516 pp.

ALAN MACFARLANE
King's College, Cambridge

This is an unusual book. It sets out to survey theoretical trends in philosophy and social science since Descartes. The central theme is the attempt by various great thinkers to overcome the Cartesian disassociation of mind and matter. Typically, the treatment of each individual consists of a brief personal biography, a few pages of exposition of main theories, five or six major criticisms, and some suggested further reading. A list of the main thinkers covered in each chapter is the best way to give an idea of its ambitious scope: 1 (Descartes, Hobbes, Spinoza, Leibniz, Locke, Hume, Kant); 2 (Schopenhauer, Nietzsche, Freud); 3 (Darwin, Watson, Skinner, Wittgenstein, Edward Wilson); 4 (Dilthey, Wundt, Boas, Benedict, Mead); 5 (Hegel, Marx, Lukacs, Sève, Vygotsky); 6 (Comte, Durkheim, Radcliffe-Brown, Dumont); 7 (William James, Dewey, G. H. Mead, Goffman); 8 (Horkheimer, Marcuse, Habermas); 9 (Kierkegaard, Husserl, Heidegger, Sartre, Merleau-Ponty); 10 (Lévi-Strauss, Piaget, Althusser, Foucault, Derrida).

Although the book is over 500 pages long, some of the main problems arise out of a lack of space. Even with this galaxy of great names, as the author notes (p. 2), because of space constraints Rousseau, Jung, Fromm, Weber, Bergson, Whitehead, and Laing had to be left out. Still others could be added, for instance, de Tocqueville, Tonnies, Simmel, and Riesman. Also, very little of the wider political, social, economic, or religious context of each of the thinkers can be provided. The book is a set of portraits of "Great Thinkers," where ideas are separated from their historical contexts. Nor, surprisingly for an anthropologist, is there any real attempt to compare this Western tradition with that in any other part of the world. The one interesting exception is in the discussion of Dumont, when the author draws on his own and colleagues' work among hunter-gatherers in relation to individualism.

Thus, we are left with an explanatory gap. As in the work of Foucault, we see the epistemes changing, but no real attempt is made to explain why they change, except through the internal clash of ideas. We are told that the Western philosophical tradition "was vitally concerned with the nature of the mind or consciousness, and its relation to the natural world" (p. 193), but little attempt is made to explain why there was this interest. This is what makes the book less than great.

Yet it is a very enriching and liberating book. Although it requires a considerable knowledge on the part of the reader and could have done with a glossary and time chart, the work is constantly stimulating and balanced. Readers will, of course, disagree with parts of the assessments of authors whose work they know. Yet, in general, Morris inspires confidence in his openhanded and honest approach. Certain authors who are now little read (for instance, Wundt and Dilthey) are especially well treated. Morris has wrestled with the original texts of some extremely difficult writers, and admits that he is sometimes confused. Yet we benefit from his "exercise in [his] own self-education" (p. v), from being introduced to many writers who are only names to most of us and being given a succinct overview of their main contributions and the objections to their work. The book is written in a clear and judicious style. It is difficult to see how any reader who perseveres could fail to be impressed and excited by what is uncovered. It would make an excellent overview text for a CD-ROM collection of "Major Philosophers of the West," where one could read Morris's introduction and then read some of the original works of the authors and selected secondary criticism.

Workers' Expressions: Beyond Accommodation and Resistance. *John Calagione, Doris Francis, and Daniel Nugent*, eds. SUNY Series in the Anthropology of Work. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992. 242 pp.

JAMES TOTH
University of Alexandria, Egypt

Labor is located within particularly potent paradoxical relations: those of hierarchy and class, of production and consumption, of dominant and popular cultures, and definitively, as this volume's title suggests, of accommodation and resistance to capitalist "domination and exploitation." The range of cultural expressions found in this collection of nine essays includes music, art, religion, festivals, kinship, community, job narratives, job descriptions, production plans, gender, and images of beauty and pleasure. Such forms mediate the labor process and the increasing commodification of life both on and off the job.

Chapters by Calagione and Nugent demonstrate how popular commercial music mediated the interactions of workers with